



# **FAMILY LAW**

## **Cases and Materials**

### **Volume II**

**Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer  
Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto**

**1995-1996**

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair, Ella Schwartz, and Faith Teo

\* \* \*

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use  
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*

110-1-24-  
BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP 12 1995

FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

**FAMILY LAW**

**Cases and Materials**

**Volume II**


**Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer  
Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto**

**1995-1996**

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair, Ella Schwartz, and Faith Teo

\* \* \*

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use  
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/familylawcasesma02roge>

## FAMILY LAW

### Table of Contents

#### Volume II

	<u>Page No.</u>
<b>V. MATRIMONIAL PROPERTY</b>	
<b>A. Historical Overview</b>	
(a) <u>Common Law</u>	
OLRC, <i>Report on Family Law, Part IV: Family Property</i> . . . . .	327
(b) <u>Trust Doctrine</u>	
LRCC, <i>Family Property</i> . . . . .	330
Note: <i>Murdoch v. Murdoch</i> and <u>Rathwell v. Rathwell</u> . . . . .	332
<i>Pettkus v. Becker</i> . . . . .	335
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Woman's Suicide Ends Fight for Rights" . . . . .	347
Note: <i>Sorochan v. Sorochan</i> . . . . .	348
<i>Peter v. Beblow</i> . . . . .	350
Note: Recent Cases on Constructive Trust <u>Harrison v. Kalinocha</u> Crick v. Ludwig . . . . .	371
(c) <u>Statutory Reform</u>	
Holland, "Reform of Matrimonial Property Law in Ontario" . . . . .	384
Wolfson, <i>The New Family Law Act</i> . . . . .	386
<b>B. The F.L.A.</b>	
(a) <u>The Partnership Principle</u>	
Knetsch, "Some Economic Implications of Matrimonial Property Rules" . . . . .	392
Prager, "Shifting Perspectives on Marital Property Law" . . . . .	401
Eekelaar, <i>Family Law and Social Policy</i> , "Adjustment on Divorce" . . . . .	406
Fineman, "Implementing Equality" . . . . .	410
Mossman, Book Review of Weitzman's <i>Divorce Revolution</i> . . . . .	416
Note: Application of Matrimonial Property Law to Aboriginal Women . . . . .	419

(b) Overview of Equalization of Net Family  
Property Under the FLA

(i) Calculation of the Equalization Payment

Goodman, "Matrimonial Property", <i>Family Law</i>	
Bar Admission Course Materials . . . . .	421
Note: Valuation Date . . . . .	433
— <i>Skrli v. Skrli</i> . . . . .	435
<i>Folga v. Folga</i> . . . . .	440
<i>Miller v. Miller</i> . . . . .	443
<i>Black v. Black</i> . . . . .	444
Fredricks, "The Ownership Conundrum" . . . . .	448
Wolfson and Corbin, "Problems of Title and and Constructive Trusts" . . . . .	450
Note: Proposed Amendments to the FLA . . . . .	451
Note: Ontario Law Reform Commission 1993 Recommendations . . . . .	452

(ii) Implementation of the Equalization Payment

<i>Humphreys v. Humphreys</i> . . . . .	453
Goodman, "Matrimonial Property", <i>Family Law</i>	
Bar Admission Course Materials . . . . .	459

(c) Selected Problems in Determining NFP

(i) Valuation and Costs of Disposition

Goodman, "Matrimonial Property", <i>Family Law</i>	
Bar Admission Course Materials . . . . .	462
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Ontario 'debtor-creditor' family law benefits property-owning spouse" . . . . .	465
<i>Sengmueller v. Sengmueller</i> . . . . .	467

(ii) Future Interests

— <i>Brinkos v. Brinkos</i> . . . . .	471
---------------------------------------	-----

### iii

(iii)	<u>Educational Degrees, Professional Licenses and other forms of "Human Capital"</u>	
	Weitzman, "The New Property" in <i>The Divorce Revolution</i> . . . . .	477
	<i>Caratun v. Caratun</i> . . . . .	484
(iv)	<u>Relevance of Constructive Trust</u>	
	<i>Kelly v. Kelly</i> . . . . .	500
	<i>Rawluk v. Rawluk</i> . . . . .	502
	Note: Applications of Constructive Trust under the <i>FLA</i> ( <i>Cox, Hapichuk, Mittler, Heon, McDonald</i> ) . . . . .	529
	Note: <i>Arndt v. Arndt</i> . . . . .	531
	Ontario Law Reform Commission 1993 Recommendations . . . . .	532
(d)	<u>Departures from Equal Sharing</u>	
(i)	<u>Depletion of Assets; Conduct</u>	
	<i>Scott v. Scott</i> . . . . .	533
	Note: <i>Cowan v. Cowan</i> . . . . .	535
(ii)	<u>Unequal Contributions</u>	
	<i>Farr v. Farr</i> . . . . .	536
	<i>LeBlanc v. LeBlanc</i> . . . . .	539
	<i>Toronto Star</i> , "A New Day in a Hard Life" . . . . .	544
	<i>Waters v. Waters</i> . . . . .	545
	<i>Sullivan v. Sullivan</i> . . . . .	549
	<i>Berdette v. Berdette</i> . . . . .	551
	Note: <i>Peake; McInnis</i> . . . . .	557
	<i>Wakelin v. Wakelin (Lawyer's Weekly)</i> . . . . .	558
(iii)	<u>Post-Separation Conduct and Anticipated Future Needs</u> . . . . .	559
(iv)	<u>Lump Sum Support as Alternative to Unequal to Unequal Division of NFP</u>	
	<i>Hines v. Hines</i> . . . . .	561
	Note: Ontario Law Reform Commission 1993 Recommendations . . . . .	564

## VI. THE MATRIMONIAL HOME

### A. Introduction

Hovius, "The Matrimonial Home" . . . . .	566
Hovius, "Possessory Rights in the Matrimonial Home" . . . . .	567

### B. The Matrimonial Home Under the Family Law Act, 1986

#### (a) Overview of Part II of the FLA

Wolfson and Corbin, "The Matrimonial Home Under the FLA" . . . . .	570
--	-----

#### (b) Orders for Exclusive Possession

Weitzman, "Disposition of the Family Home" from <i>The Divorce Revolution</i> . . . . .	575
Bissett-Johnson and Holland, <i>Matrimonial Property Law in Canada</i> . . . . .	580
<i>Hill v. Hill</i> . . . . .	582

#### (c) Groups Precluded from Protection . . . . . 588

## VII. SPOUSAL SUPPORT

### A. Historical Origins of Spousal Support

Eekelaar and Maclean, <i>Maintenance After Divorce</i> . . . . .	590
--	-----

### B. Law Reform: Modern Spousal Support Law

Eekelaar and Maclean, "The Evolution of Private Law Maintenance Obligations" . . . . .	591
LRCC, <i>Maintenance on Divorce</i> . . . . .	593
Smart, <i>The Ties that Bind</i> . . . . .	599
Davies, "The Changing Face of Spousal Support Law in Canada" . . . . .	600
Rogerson, "Spousal Support After <i>Moge</i> " . . . . .	605



**C. Spousal Support Under the Divorce Act, 1985 and the Family Law Act, 1986**

**(a) The Rose of the Clean Break Principle and the Causal Connection Test**

<i>Messier v. Delage</i> . . . . .	611
Note: The Supreme Court of Canada "Trilogy" <i>Pelech, Richardson</i> and <i>Caron</i> . . . . .	615
<i>Pelech v. Pelech</i> . . . . .	616
<i>Richardson v. Richardson</i> . . . . .	628
<i>Karlovec v. Karlovec</i> . . . . .	636
<i>Bast v. Bast</i> . . . . .	639
<i>Seward v. Seward</i> . . . . .	640

**(b) The Law Shifts: *Moge v. Moge***

Rogerson, " <i>Spousal Support after Moge</i> " . . . . .	642
<i>Heinemann v. Heinemann</i> . . . . .	643
<i>Moge v. Moge</i> . . . . .	647

**(i) Assessing the Economic Consequences of the Relationship; Quantifying Support; Lump Sum v. Periodic Awards**

<i>Ross v. Ross</i> . . . . .	672
<i>Chalmers v. Chalmers</i> . . . . .	673
<i>Elliot v. Elliot</i> . . . . .	677
Note: <i>MacNeil v. MacNeil</i> . . . . .	693
<i>Kennedy v. Kennedy</i> . . . . .	694
<i>Leek v. Lightfoot</i> . . . . .	699
<i>Morison v. Morison</i> . . . . .	702

**(ii) The Continuing Role of Needs-Based Support**

Note: <i>Andersen v. Carter</i> ; . . . . .	707
<i>Parish v. Parish</i> ; . . . . .	708
<i>Colletta v. Colletta</i> ; <i>Snyder v. Snyder</i> ; . . . . .	708
<i>Devernichuk v. Devernichuk</i> ; <i>Mahoney v. Mahoney</i> . . . . .	710
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Ont. Nurse Ordered to Pay Unemployed Husband \$1,350 in Monthly Support" . . . . .	712

**(iii) The Continuing Relevance of Conduct**

<i>Anderson v. Anderson (Lawyer's Weekly)</i> . . . . .	714
<i>MacDonald v. MacDonald (Lawyer's Weekly)</i> . . . . .	715
<i>Melanson v. Melanson (Lawyer's Weekly)</i> . . . . .	716

